

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

|                                                                                           |            |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
| <b>Preface .....</b>                                                                      | <b>iii</b> |
| <b>Acknowledgments .....</b>                                                              | <b>vii</b> |
| <b>Part I Overview .....</b>                                                              | <b>1</b>   |
| <b>Chapter 1 Introduction .....</b>                                                       | <b>3</b>   |
| 1.1 Sketch of Historical Development of CFD .....                                         | 3          |
| 1.2 The New Impetus Toward Higher Quality Solutions .....                                 | 7          |
| 1.3 A Personal Anecdote Illustrating the Importance of Systematic Code Verification ..... | 11         |
| References for Chapter 1 .....                                                            | 14         |
| <b>Chapter 2 Semantics: Terminology, Taxonomies, and Definitions .....</b>                | <b>19</b>  |
| 2.1 Introduction .....                                                                    | 19         |
| 2.2 Semantics .....                                                                       | 20         |
| 2.3 Code Verification and Validation: Numerical vs. Conceptual Modeling .....             | 23         |
| 2.4 Code Confirmation .....                                                               | 30         |
| 2.5 Benchmarks and Inter-Code Comparisons .....                                           | 31         |
| 2.6 Code Certification, Quality Assurance, and Accreditation .....                        | 33         |
| 2.7 Verification of Calculations .....                                                    | 35         |
| 2.8 Quantification of Uncertainty .....                                                   | 36         |
| 2.9 Grid Convergence vs. Iterative Convergence .....                                      | 36         |
| 2.10 Error Taxonomies .....                                                               | 36         |

|                                                                            |    |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------|----|
| 2.11 Truncation Error vs. Discretization Error.....                        | 43 |
| 2.12 Calibration and Tuning.....                                           | 44 |
| 2.13 Quality assurance (QA) vs. Quality Work.....                          | 46 |
| 2.14 Customer Illusions vs. Customer Care .....                            | 46 |
| 2.15 Other Distinctions: Authors, Users, Modelers, Code and Software ..... | 47 |
| 2.16 Sensitivity, Uncertainty, and Risk .....                              | 48 |
| 2.17 Etymology and Near Synonyms .....                                     | 49 |
| 2.18 Accuracy vs. Reliability.....                                         | 49 |
| 2.19 Additional Remarks on Verification.....                               | 50 |
| 2.20 Conclusion: Limitations of Semantic Distinctions .....                | 51 |
| References for Chapter 2 .....                                             | 52 |

## **Part II Verification.....63**

### **Chapter 3 A Methodology for Accuracy Verification of Codes: the Method of Manufactured Solutions.....65**

|                                                                                                                                             |    |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----|
| 3.1 Introduction .....                                                                                                                      | 65 |
| 3.2 Warnings: the Division of Labor in Code Development and Use .....                                                                       | 65 |
| 3.3 Order of Convergence.....                                                                                                               | 66 |
| 3.4 A General Procedure for Generating an Analytical Solution for Code Accuracy Verification:<br>the Method of Manufactured Solutions ..... | 67 |
| 3.5 Example: Verification of a 3-D Poisson Equation Code in Nonorthogonal Grid<br>and a 3-D Grid Generation Code .....                      | 70 |
| 3.6 Another Path to Manufactured Solutions .....                                                                                            | 79 |
| 3.7 Code Verification Including Shock Waves .....                                                                                           | 79 |
| 3.8 Need for a Theorem.....                                                                                                                 | 81 |
| 3.9 Specific Analytical Solutions .....                                                                                                     | 81 |
| 3.10 Manufactured Solutions vs. Infinite Series Solutions.....                                                                              | 82 |
| 3.11 The Sensitivity of Grid Convergence Testing .....                                                                                      | 82 |
| 3.12 Examples of Unanticipated Convergence Rates Determined by Systematic Grid Convergence Tests.....                                       | 83 |
| 3.13 Special Considerations for Problems with Multiple Scales: Turbulence Modeling.....                                                     | 88 |
| 3.14 Warnings: What the Method Does Not “Verify” .....                                                                                      | 88 |
| 3.15 Robustness and Confidence .....                                                                                                        | 89 |
| References for Chapter 3 .....                                                                                                              | 90 |

### **Chapter 4 Error Estimation for Quantification of Uncertainty; Verification of Calculations .....95**

|                                                                                 |     |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 4.1 Introduction .....                                                          | 95  |
| 4.2 Error Estimation for Grid Adaptation vs. Quantification of Uncertainty..... | 96  |
| 4.3 Taxonomy for Additional Information for Error Estimates .....               | 97  |
| 4.4 Grid Refining and Coarsening .....                                          | 98  |
| 4.5 Levels of Simulation Use.....                                               | 99  |
| 4.6 Verification of Computer Round-off Errors .....                             | 100 |
| 4.7 Effect of Differing formulations .....                                      | 103 |
| References for Chapter 4 .....                                                  | 103 |

### **Chapter 5 Systematic Grid Convergence Studies and the Grid Convergence Index (GCI) .....107**

|                                                    |     |
|----------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 5.1 Introduction .....                             | 107 |
| 5.2 Background on Grid Convergence Reporting ..... | 108 |

|                                                                                                       |     |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 5.3 Richardson Extrapolation .....                                                                    | 109 |
| 5.4 A Generalization of Richardson Extrapolation.....                                                 | 112 |
| 5.5 Richardson's Extrapolation for $\pi$ .....                                                        | 114 |
| 5.6 Grid Convergence Index for the Fine Grid Solution .....                                           | 114 |
| 5.7 Grid Convergence Index for the Coarse Grid Solution .....                                         | 117 |
| 5.8 Example GCI Calculation.....                                                                      | 119 |
| 5.9 Should the Coefficient Be "1" Or "3" Or "1.25"?.....                                              | 120 |
| 5.10 Additional Features of Grid Convergence Studies for Verification of Codes and Calculations ..... | 123 |
| 5.11 Conclusion.....                                                                                  | 135 |
| References for Chapter 5 .....                                                                        | 136 |

## **Chapter 6 Applications of Systematic Grid Convergence Studies and the Grid Convergence Index .....143**

|                                                                                            |     |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 6.1 Introduction .....                                                                     | 143 |
| 6.2 Two Further Examples of (Partial) Code Verification in Groundwater Flow .....          | 144 |
| 6.3 Issues in Calculation Verification.....                                                | 157 |
| 6.4 An Example of the Effective Grid Refinement Ratio.....                                 | 158 |
| 6.5 A Benchmark Problem for Driven Cavity Flow .....                                       | 160 |
| 6.6 A Benchmark Problem for Free Convection .....                                          | 160 |
| 6.7 Laminar Plane Jet Impinging on a Heated Flat Plate .....                               | 162 |
| 6.8 A $k$ - $\epsilon$ Model of a Free Shear Layer .....                                   | 162 |
| 6.9 Transonic Airfoil Calculations .....                                                   | 163 |
| 6.10 Ordered Estimation of Far-Field Boundary Error .....                                  | 166 |
| 6.11 Artificial Dissipation Effects .....                                                  | 168 |
| 6.12 Single and Dual Porosity Contaminant Transport: Source Term Location .....            | 170 |
| 6.13 Convergence Behaviors for Mixed-Order Methods .....                                   | 179 |
| 6.14 Grid Convergence of Zero Drag Coefficient.....                                        | 180 |
| 6.15 Anomalous Result Possibly Due to Grid Stretching.....                                 | 181 |
| 6.16 Non-Smooth Property Variation: Global Error Norms .....                               | 182 |
| 6.17 Discrete Vortex Methods.....                                                          | 184 |
| 6.18 Observed Convergence Rates for Euler Equations with Shocks .....                      | 185 |
| 6.19 Completed Richardson Extrapolation.....                                               | 187 |
| 6.20 Truncation Error in Elliptic Grid Generation .....                                    | 187 |
| 6.21 One Dimensional Moving Adaptive Grid Problems .....                                   | 189 |
| 6.22 GCI Application in Solution Adaptive Grids with Non-Integer Grid Refinement.....      | 189 |
| 6.23 High Quality Grid Resolution Studies Leading to a Safety Factor of 1.25 .....         | 190 |
| 6.24 Transport Code Verifications Using the GCI: Partitioning the Option Matrix .....      | 190 |
| 6.25 Turbulent Separated Flow: the Error Estimator of Celik and Karatekin .....            | 195 |
| 6.26 Level of Accuracy Estimates from Grid Convergence Studies .....                       | 197 |
| 6.27 Other Examples of Careful Use of Richardson Extrapolation.....                        | 198 |
| 6.28 Parameter Convergences of a Compressible Flow Code Near the Incompressible Limit..... | 198 |
| 6.29 Justification of the Dupuit Approximation .....                                       | 203 |
| 6.30 Concluding Comment on Parameter Uncertainty vs. Numerical Uncertainty.....            | 206 |
| References for Chapter 6 .....                                                             | 207 |

## **Chapter 7 Single Grid Error Estimators .....217**

|                                                                                                       |     |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 7.1 Error Estimation from Higher or Lower Order Accuracy Solutions on the Same Grid (Category B)..... | 218 |
| 7.2 Auxiliary PDE Solutions on the Same Grid (Category C) .....                                       | 220 |
| 7.3 Auxiliary Algebraic Evaluations on the Same Grid: Surrogate Estimators (Category D) .....         | 223 |
| 7.4 Time Accuracy Estimation .....                                                                    | 228 |
| 7.5 Concluding Remarks on Single Grid Error Estimators .....                                          | 230 |
| References for Chapter 7 .....                                                                        | 231 |

|                                                                                                             |                |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------|
| <b>Chapter 8 Hard Stories .....</b>                                                                         | <b>237</b>     |
| 8.1 Factors Influencing Convergence Rates .....                                                             | 237            |
| 8.2 Behavior of Quasi-Higher-Order Methods .....                                                            | 245            |
| 8.3 Some Good News for Turbulence Modeling .....                                                            | 250            |
| 8.4 The Myth of the Converged "Solution" .....                                                              | 251            |
| 8.5 Esoteric Coding Mistakes .....                                                                          | 253            |
| 8.6 A False Verification Test of a Particle Tracker .....                                                   | 253            |
| 8.8 Hard-Wired Data vs. User Input Data .....                                                               | 258            |
| 8.9 Degraded Rate of Convergence Due to User Modeling Errors .....                                          | 259            |
| 8.10 Lessons from Nonlinear Dynamics .....                                                                  | 259            |
| 8.11 Adaptive and Local Time Stepping, and Steady State .....                                               | 263            |
| 8.12 Other Questions Related to the Steady State .....                                                      | 263            |
| References for Chapter 8 .....                                                                              | 264            |
| <br><b>Part III Validation .....</b>                                                                        | <br><b>271</b> |
| <br><b>Chapter 9 Difficulties With Experiments and Validation .....</b>                                     | <br><b>273</b> |
| 9.1 Credulousness .....                                                                                     | 273            |
| 9.2 Historical Methods of Validating Scientific Theories .....                                              | 275            |
| 9.3 The Theory Laden Experiment .....                                                                       | 276            |
| 9.4 Random and Systematic Errors in Experiments .....                                                       | 277            |
| 9.5 Experimental Errors in Physical Properties .....                                                        | 278            |
| 9.6 Boundary Conditions, Continuum and Numerical .....                                                      | 278            |
| 9.7 Trends, Computational and Experimental .....                                                            | 278            |
| 9.8 False Negatives and False Positives .....                                                               | 280            |
| 9.9 "Nearby" Problems .....                                                                                 | 280            |
| 9.10 Difficulty of the Option Tree .....                                                                    | 282            |
| 9.11 Data Sparsity and Lack of Synchronicity: Groundwater, Ocean/Lake, and Meteorology Modeling .....       | 282            |
| 9.12 The Effect of Parameter Resolution on Grid Convergence .....                                           | 284            |
| 9.13 Scale of Unsteadiness .....                                                                            | 284            |
| 9.14 Spatial Scales, Scaling Up, and Dimensionality .....                                                   | 286            |
| 9.15 Assumptions of Periodicity .....                                                                       | 288            |
| 9.16 Other Difficulties of Validation in Aerospace .....                                                    | 289            |
| 9.17 Universal Turbulence Models vs. Zonal Modeling .....                                                   | 289            |
| 9.18 Strong and Weak Model Definitions and Model Validation .....                                           | 291            |
| 9.19 The Myth of the Totally Validated Code .....                                                           | 292            |
| References for Chapter 9 .....                                                                              | 293            |
| <br><b>Chapter 10 Methodologies and Examples of Validations,<br/>Calibrations, and Certifications .....</b> | <br><b>299</b> |
| 10.1 Sources of Physical Modeling Errors in Aerodynamics CFD .....                                          | 299            |
| 10.2 Accuracy Level for Validation .....                                                                    | 300            |
| 10.3 Generic Models vs. Realistic Models for Validation and Calibration: Phases of Validation .....         | 301            |
| 10.4 CFD and Experimental Facility Corrections .....                                                        | 303            |
| 10.5 Verification Must Be Independent of Validation: Airfoil Calculations .....                             | 304            |
| 10.6 Synergism Between Computation and Validation Experiments .....                                         | 304            |
| 10.7 The Difficulty of Defining a "Nearby" Problem .....                                                    | 308            |
| 10.8 Missing Experimental Details .....                                                                     | 309            |
| 10.9 Onset of 3 Dimensionality in Backstep Flow .....                                                       | 309            |
| 10.10 Gray Area: "Validation" from a Calculated Benchmark .....                                             | 310            |
| 10.11 Gray Area: "Validation" of an Experimental Technique by a Computation .....                           | 310            |

|                                                                                     |            |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
| 10.12 The MADE-2 Experience: Can Groundwater Flow Models Be Validated? .....        | 311        |
| 10.13 Dynamic Stall Wind Tunnel Data: Who Does the Tweaking? .....                  | 313        |
| 10.14 Consortium Effort at CFD Code Certification .....                             | 314        |
| 10.15 Simulation Team Responsibilities in Validation .....                          | 323        |
| 10.16 Shifting Responsibilities and Gray Areas .....                                | 324        |
| 10.17 WUA Benchmarks in 1994 and 1996 .....                                         | 325        |
| 10.18 CFD Triathlons .....                                                          | 326        |
| 10.19 Canadian CFD Society Test Case .....                                          | 326        |
| 10.20 Workshops .....                                                               | 327        |
| 10.21 AGARD 1988 Validation of Computational Fluid Dynamics .....                   | 327        |
| 10.22 A Case Study for CFD Code Validation Methodology .....                        | 330        |
| 10.23 Joint Consideration of Experimental and Simulation Uncertainties .....        | 331        |
| 10.24 Dynamic Databases for Validation .....                                        | 335        |
| References for Chapter 10 .....                                                     | 340        |
| <b>Part IV Broader Issues .....</b>                                                 | <b>349</b> |
| <b>Chapter 11 Code Quality Assurance and Certification .....</b>                    | <b>351</b> |
| 11.1 Introduction .....                                                             | 351        |
| 11.2 Quality Assurance (QA) vs. Quality Work .....                                  | 352        |
| 11.3 QA vs. Creativity .....                                                        | 352        |
| 11.4 QA and Temperament Types .....                                                 | 352        |
| 11.5 The Prevalence of Errors in Scientific Software: Use of Static Analyzers ..... | 353        |
| 11.6 Factors of Code Quality Assurance .....                                        | 356        |
| 11.7 Some Components of Project Code Certification .....                            | 357        |
| 11.8 Engineering Teams and the Division of Labor .....                              | 358        |
| 11.9 Personnel Roles, Code Levels, and Code Sources .....                           | 359        |
| 11.10 Desirable (But Not Required) Code Characteristics .....                       | 359        |
| 11.11 Code Documentation .....                                                      | 362        |
| 11.12 Code Module Communication Structure .....                                     | 364        |
| 11.13 Code Updates .....                                                            | 364        |
| 11.14 Built in Automatic Error Detection Tests .....                                | 365        |
| 11.15 Designing for Code Maintenance .....                                          | 366        |
| 11.16 Commercial Codes and their Users .....                                        | 366        |
| 11.17 Code to Code Comparisons .....                                                | 366        |
| 11.18 General Software Certification and ISO-9000 Standards .....                   | 367        |
| 11.19 QA for Large Public Policy Projects .....                                     | 367        |
| 11.20 QA of Analyses .....                                                          | 368        |
| 11.21 QA / Certification of Users and Regulators .....                              | 368        |
| 11.22 Assessment of Codes? Or Users? .....                                          | 368        |
| 11.23 QA Procedures .....                                                           | 370        |
| 11.24 A Template for a QA System .....                                              | 374        |
| 11.25 Concluding Remarks On QA .....                                                | 380        |
| References for Chapter 11 .....                                                     | 380        |
| <b>Chapter 12 Conclusions .....</b>                                                 | <b>385</b> |
| 12.1 The Overall Process for Quantification of Uncertainty .....                    | 385        |
| 12.2 Internet Archive .....                                                         | 387        |
| 12.3 Fulfilling the Promise of Computational Power .....                            | 387        |

|                                                                                                        |            |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
| <b>Appendix A. Need for Control of Numerical Accuracy .....</b>                                        | <b>389</b> |
| I. Introduction .....                                                                                  | 390        |
| II. Resistance and Objections .....                                                                    | 390        |
| III. Difficulties in Applications.....                                                                 | 395        |
| IV. Examples of What Can Be Done.....                                                                  | 396        |
| V. Conclusions and Recommendations .....                                                               | 396        |
| Appendix: Editorial Policy Statement on the Control of Numerical Accuracy.....                         | 398        |
| Acknowledgments .....                                                                                  | 399        |
| References.....                                                                                        | 399        |
| <br><b>Appendix B. Other Journal Policy Statements</b>                                                 |            |
| <b>on Control of Numerical Accuracy .....</b>                                                          | <b>403</b> |
| Journal of Heat Transfer Editorial Policy Statement on Numerical Accuracy.....                         | 403        |
| International Journal for Numerical Methods in Fluids-Editorial .....                                  | 406        |
| AIAA Editorial Policy Statement on Numerical Accuracy and Experimental Uncertainty.....                | 407        |
| Journal of Fluids Engineering-Editorial and Policy Statement .....                                     | 408        |
| Policy Statement on the Control of Numerical Accuracy .....                                            | 410        |
| <br><b>Appendix C. Comment on Oreskes et al .....</b>                                                  | <b>413</b> |
| Comment on "Verification, Validation, and Confirmation of Numerical Models in the Earth Sciences"..... | 413        |
| References.....                                                                                        | 417        |
| <br><b>Appendix D. CFD Parody: Will the Wind Tunnel Replace the Computer? .....</b>                    | <b>419</b> |
| Original .....                                                                                         | 419        |
| Response .....                                                                                         | 420        |
| <br><b>Appendix E. A Biographical Sketch of Lewis Fry Richardson.....</b>                              | <b>423</b> |
| References.....                                                                                        | 427        |
| <br><b>Index .....</b>                                                                                 | <b>429</b> |